

15

Senator John McCain (R-AZ):

# WHY ILLEGAL ALIENS SHOULD GET SOCIAL SECURITY



**Hillary:** Back on May 22, 2006, you appeared on Fox News Sunday with Chris Wallace. Wallace asked you this question: "This

past week, you were one of the leaders in a 50-49 vote that will allow illegal immigrants to collect Social Security benefits even if they got their job illegally by forging documents. You were one of only 11 Republicans who voted for it. At a time when social security is running out of money, should we allow illegals to benefit from committing a felony?"<sup>1</sup> Senator McCain, what was your answer?

**Hillary:** Don't you think it's unfair that conservatives like Rush Limbaugh are saying they broke the law and that they shouldn't benefit from that?

in the country that they came from, so that there would be incentives for them to return home. **But if you just said I'm sorry, you came here illegally, even though you paid into the trust fund, we're just taking your money, I don't think that's really fair, either.**"<sup>3</sup>

**McCain:**

"Well, they paid the taxes. Do you want to re-fund — at least shouldn't you then, if you don't

want them to get benefits — they paid the taxes. They came out of their salaries, and so they contributed. Should they at least not — should they be deprived of the taxes that they paid? I don't think that's fair."<sup>2</sup>

**McCain:** ... that's the same argument that we made throughout this debate, that we are giving them amnesty. **Look, the taxes were taken out of their paychecks.** They were put into a fund that is a legitimate fund. **Of course, they were illegal because they were here illegally.** But what we'd like to do over time, and I think we could do this over time, is establish some of these funds back



**Rush:** We have on the table an agreement with Mexico that makes it possible for foreign workers to qualify for social security payments. It is called a "totalization" agreement.

"In March, 2003, the Office of the Chief Actuary estimated that the cost of the Mexican agreement would be \$78 million in the first year and would grow to \$650 million. ... However, this proxy figure does not directly consider the estimated millions of current and former unauthorized workers and family members from Mexico and appears small in comparison with those estimates. The estimate also inherently assumes that the behavior of Mexican citizens would not change and does not recognize that an agreement would create additional incentive for unauthorized workers to enter the United States to work and maintain documentation to claim their earnings under a false identity. ... Similarly, under current law, noncitizen dependents and survivors can also receive social security benefits under some circumstances."<sup>4</sup>



**Perot:**

There's that giant sucking sound of the money you thought was going for your retirement. Wrong! It's going to illegal aliens, and their families living back in Mexico. Thanks for sharing!!

<sup>1</sup>Transcript: Sen. John McCain on 'FOX News Sunday,' taped Monday, May 21, 2006. Accessed 5/23/06 at <http://www.foxnews.com/story/0,2933,196366,00.html>

<sup>2</sup>Ibid., as spoken by Senator McCain

<sup>3</sup>Ibid., as spoken by Senator McCain

<sup>4</sup>US General Accounting Office. Social Security. Proposed Totalization Agreement with Mexico Presents Unique Challenges." September, 2003, p. Executive Summary and p. 8. Accessed 5/25/06 at <http://www.gao.gov/new.items/d03993.pdf>